

Heidelberg – December 15th, 2008

Christoph Luhn (University of Southampton)

in collaboration with Pierre Ramond (University of Florida)

# Anomaly-free discrete family symmetries

- arXiv:0805.1736 [JHEP 07 (2008) 085]
- arXiv:0807.1749 [accepted in PLB]

## Outline

- motivation
- basic mathematical concepts
- gauge origin & anomalies
- embedding finite into continuous groups
- discrete indices
- discrete anomaly conditions

## Fermionic mass structure

### quarks

$$m_u : m_c : m_t \sim \lambda_c^8 : \lambda_c^4 : 1$$

$$m_d : m_s : m_b \sim \lambda_c^4 : \lambda_c^2 : 1$$

$$\text{CKM} \sim \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \lambda_c & \lambda_c^3 \\ \lambda_c & 1 & \lambda_c^2 \\ \lambda_c^3 & \lambda_c^2 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

⇒ quark masses and mixing are hierarchical

### leptons

$$m_e : m_\mu : m_\tau \sim \lambda_c^{4 \text{ or } 5} : \lambda_c^2 : 1$$

$$m_{\nu_1} : m_{\nu_2} : m_{\nu_3} \sim \begin{cases} \lambda_c^{\geq 1} : \lambda_c : 1 & \text{MNSP} \sim \begin{pmatrix} 0.8 & 0.5 & < 0.2 \\ 0.4 & 0.6 & 0.7 \\ 0.4 & 0.6 & 0.7 \end{pmatrix} \\ 1 : 1 : \lambda_c^{\geq 1} \\ 1 : 1 : 1 \end{cases}$$

⇒ neutrino sector is different

## Tri-bimaximal mixing

$$\text{MNSP} \approx U_{\mathcal{T}\mathcal{B}} \equiv \begin{pmatrix} \sqrt{\frac{2}{3}} & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & 0 \\ -\frac{1}{\sqrt{6}} & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & -\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \\ -\frac{1}{\sqrt{6}} & \frac{1}{\sqrt{3}} & \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\Rightarrow \left\{ \begin{array}{lll} \text{MNSP-angles} & \text{tri-bimax.} & 3\sigma \text{ exp.} \\ \hline \sin^2 \theta_{12} : & 0.33 & 0.24 - 0.40 \\ \sin^2 \theta_{23} : & 0.50 & 0.34 - 0.68 \\ \sin^2 \theta_{13} : & 0 & \leq 0.041 \end{array} \right.$$

## Effective neutrino mass matrix

- in basis where charged lepton mass matrix is diagonal

$$M_\nu \sim M_{\mathcal{T}\mathcal{B}} = \begin{pmatrix} \alpha & \beta & \beta \\ \beta & \gamma & \alpha + \beta - \gamma \\ \beta & \alpha + \beta - \gamma & \gamma \end{pmatrix}$$

- How can we obtain such relations between entries of mass matrix ?
  - unify families into multiplets of a symmetry group  $\mathcal{G}$  (assignment)
  - break  $\mathcal{G}$  spontaneously (vacuum alignment)
  - construct invariants of  $\mathcal{G}$  inserting vacuum structure

$\mathcal{G}$  = non-Abelian finite group

## Abelian finite groups: $\mathcal{Z}_N$

- $\mathcal{Z}_N = \{1, e^{2\pi i \frac{1}{N}}, e^{2\pi i \frac{2}{N}}, \dots, e^{2\pi i \frac{N-1}{N}}\}$
- $N$  elements
- one generator  $a \in \mathcal{Z}_N$  (e.g.  $a = e^{2\pi i/N}$ )
- group operation = multiplication of complex numbers
- only one-dimensional irreps

## Non-Abelian finite groups, e.g. $S_3$

group multiplication table:

	1	$a_1$	$a_2$	$b_1$	$b_2$	$b_3$
1	1	$a_1$	$a_2$	$b_1$	$b_2$	$b_3$
$a_1$	$a_1$	$a_2$	1	$b_2$	$b_3$	$b_1$
$a_2$	$a_2$	1	$a_1$	$b_3$	$b_1$	$b_2$
$b_1$	$b_1$	$b_3$	$b_2$	1	$a_2$	$a_1$
$b_2$	$b_2$	$b_1$	$b_3$	$a_1$	1	$a_2$
$b_3$	$b_3$	$b_2$	$b_1$	$a_2$	$a_1$	1

generators and the presentation:

choose generators  $a \equiv a_1$  and  $b \equiv b_1 \Rightarrow a_2 = a^2, b_2 = ab, b_3 = ba$

$\langle a, b \mid a^3 = b^2 = 1, bab^{-1} = a^{-1} \rangle$  defines the group uniquely

## Irreducible representations

irreducible representations:

$$\mathbf{1} : \quad a = 1, \quad b = 1$$

$$\mathbf{1}' : \quad a = 1, \quad b = -1$$

$$\mathbf{2} : \quad a = \begin{pmatrix} e^{2\pi i/3} & 0 \\ 0 & e^{-2\pi i/3} \end{pmatrix}, \quad b = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & 1 \\ 1 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

conjugacy classes:

$$1 C_1(1) = \{g 1 g^{-1} \mid g \in S_3\} = \{1\}$$

$$2 C_2(a) = \{g a g^{-1} \mid g \in S_3\} = \{a, a^2\}$$

$$3 C_3(b) = \{g b g^{-1} \mid g \in S_3\} = \{b, ab, ba\}$$

$$\text{number of classes} = \text{number of irreps}$$

$$\text{number of elements} = \sum (\text{dimension of irrep})^2$$

## Kronecker products

general formula:

$$\mathbf{r} \otimes \mathbf{s} = d(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{s}, \mathbf{t}) \mathbf{t} , \quad d(\mathbf{r}, \mathbf{s}, \mathbf{t}) = \frac{1}{N} \sum_i n_i \chi_i^{[\mathbf{r}]} \chi_i^{[\mathbf{s}]} \bar{\chi}_i^{[\mathbf{t}]}$$

- $N$  = number of group elements
- $n_i$  = number of elements in conjugacy class  $C_i$
- character  $\chi$  = trace of the matrix representation of element  $g$

$\mathcal{S}_3$	1			2			3		
	$C_1(1)$	$C_2(a)$	$C_3(b)$						
$\chi^{[1]}$	1	1	1						
$\chi^{[1']}$	1	1	-1						
$\chi^{[2]}$	2	-1	0						

$$\left. \begin{array}{l} \mathbf{1}' \otimes \mathbf{1}' = 1 \\ \mathbf{1}' \otimes \mathbf{2} = 2 \\ \mathbf{2} \otimes \mathbf{2} = 1 + \mathbf{1}' + \mathbf{2} \end{array} \right\}$$

## Possible discrete family symmetries $\mathcal{G}$

- symmetry group:  $\text{SM} \times \mathcal{G}$
- three families
- $\mathcal{G}$  should have two- or three-dimensional irreps
- $\mathcal{G}$  is a finite subgroup of either
  - $SU(3)$  e.g.  $\mathcal{PSL}_2(7)$ ,  $\mathcal{Z}_7 \rtimes \mathcal{Z}_3$ ,  $\Delta(27)$ ,  $\Delta(3n^2)$ ,  $\Delta(54)$ ,  $\Delta(6n^2)$
  - $SO(3)$  e.g.  $\mathcal{S}_4$ ,  $\mathcal{A}_4$ ,  $\mathcal{S}_3$ ,  $\mathcal{D}_n$
  - $SU(2)$  e.g.  $\mathcal{T}'$ ,  $\mathcal{Q}_{2n}$

example:  $\mathcal{A}_4$  (irreps  $\mathbf{1}$ ,  $\mathbf{1}'$ ,  $\overline{\mathbf{1}'}$ ,  $\mathbf{3}$ )

$$L \sim \mathbf{3}, \quad E^c \sim \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'}, \quad N^c \sim \mathbf{3}$$

## Gauging discrete symmetries

- discrete symmetries violated by quantum gravity effects
- unless they are remnants of a gauge symmetry
  - “discrete gauge symmetry”

$$G_f \supset \mathcal{G}$$

gauge symmetry

discrete symmetry

## A N O M A L I E S

## Possible anomalies

$$SU(3)_C \times SU(2)_W \times U(1)_Y \times G_f$$

- $G_f = U(1)$

$$SU(3)_C - SU(3)_C - U(1) \quad U(1)_Y - U(1)_Y - U(1)$$

$$SU(2)_W - SU(2)_W - U(1) \quad U(1)_Y - U(1) - U(1)$$

$$\text{Gravity} - \text{Gravity} - U(1) \quad U(1) - U(1) - U(1)$$

→ constraints on possible  $\mathcal{Z}_N \subset U(1)$  symmetries

- $G_f = SU(3)$

$$SU(3) - SU(3) - SU(3) \quad SU(3) - SU(3) - U(1)_Y$$

→ What can we extract in this case?

## Recap: $G_f = U(1)$

- formulate anomaly equations for  $G_f$  in terms of  $U(1)$  charges  $z_i$

structure :  $\sum_i z_i = 0$

- insert discrete charges  $q_i$  instead of  $U(1)$  charges  $\boxed{z_i = q_i \text{ mod } N}$

$$\sum_i q_i = 0 \text{ mod } N$$

- separate light and heavy fermions ( $\mathcal{Z}_N$  invariant mass term)

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} q_i + \underbrace{\sum_{i=\text{heavy}} q_i}_{0 \text{ mod } N \text{ or } \frac{N}{2}} = 0 \text{ mod } N$$

$$\Rightarrow \sum_{i=\text{light}} q_i = 0 \text{ mod } N \text{ or } \frac{N}{2}$$

## Cubic anomaly for $G_f = SU(3)$

- formulate cubic anomaly equation for  $G_f$  in terms of  $SU(3)$  irreps  $\rho$

$$\sum_{\rho} A(\rho) = 0 \quad A(\rho) = \text{cubic Dynkin index}$$

- replace all  $SU(3)$  parameters:  $\rho \rightarrow \sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$  and  $A(\rho) = \sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) \bmod N_A$

$$\sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) = 0 \bmod N_A \quad \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) = \text{discrete cubic index}$$

- separate light and heavy fermions ( $\mathcal{G}$  invariant mass term)

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) + \underbrace{\sum_{i=\text{heavy}} \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)}_{0 \bmod N'_A} &= 0 \bmod N_A \\ \implies \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) &= 0 \bmod N'_A \end{aligned}$$

## Mixed anomaly for $G_f = SU(3)$

- formulate mixed anomaly equation for  $G_f$  in terms of  $SU(3)$  irreps  $\rho$

$$\sum_{\rho} \ell(\rho) \cdot Y(\rho) = 0 \quad \ell(\rho) = \text{quadratic Dynkin index}$$

- replace all  $SU(3)$  parameters:  $\rho \rightarrow \sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$  and  $\boxed{\ell(\rho) = \sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \bmod N_\ell}$

$$\sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \cdot Y(\mathbf{r}_i) = 0 \bmod N_\ell \quad \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) = \text{discrete quadratic index}$$

- separate light and heavy fermions ( $\mathcal{G}$  invariant mass term)

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \cdot Y(\mathbf{r}_i) + \underbrace{\sum_{i=\text{heavy}} \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \cdot Y(\mathbf{r}_i)}_{0 \bmod N'_\ell} &= 0 \bmod N_\ell \\ \implies \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \cdot Y(\mathbf{r}_i) &= 0 \bmod N'_\ell \end{aligned}$$

In the following:  $\mathcal{G} = \mathbb{Z}_7 \rtimes \mathbb{Z}_3$  ( $T_7$ )

## Embedding $\mathcal{T}_7$ into $SU(3)$

irreps of  $\mathcal{T}_7$ :

$$\mathbf{3}, \overline{\mathbf{3}}, \mathbf{1}, \mathbf{1}', \overline{\mathbf{1}'}$$

some  $\mathcal{T}_7$  Kronecker products:

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \mathbf{3} = \mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}} + \overline{\mathbf{3}}$$

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \overline{\mathbf{3}} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + \mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}}$$

in  $SU(3)$ :

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \mathbf{3} = \overline{\mathbf{3}} + \mathbf{6}$$

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \overline{\mathbf{3}} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{8}$$

$SU(3) \supset \mathcal{T}_7$
(10) : $\mathbf{3} = \mathbf{3}$
(01) : $\overline{\mathbf{3}} = \overline{\mathbf{3}}$
(20) : $\mathbf{6} = \mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}}$
(11) : $\mathbf{8} = \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + \mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}}$
(30) : $\mathbf{10} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{3} + 2 \cdot \overline{\mathbf{3}}$
(21) : $\mathbf{15} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 2 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}})$
(40) : $\mathbf{15}' = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 2 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}})$
(05) : $\mathbf{21} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 3 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}})$
(13) : $\mathbf{24} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 3 \cdot \mathbf{3} + 4 \cdot \overline{\mathbf{3}}$
(22) : $\mathbf{27} = \mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 4 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}})$

## Irreps $\rho$ of $SU(3)$ and their indices

cubic index:  $\text{Tr} \left( \left\{ T_a^{[\rho]}, T_b^{[\rho]} \right\} T_c^{[\rho]} \right) = A(\rho) \frac{d_{abc}}{2}$

quadratic index:  $\text{Tr} \left( \left\{ T_a^{[\rho]}, T_b^{[\rho]} \right\} \right) = \ell(\rho) \delta_{ab}$

Irreps $\rho$ of $SU(3)$	$A(\rho)$	$\ell(\rho)$
(10): <b>3</b>	1	1
(20): <b>6</b>	7	5
(11): <b>8</b>	0	6
(30): <b>10</b>	27	15
(21): <b>15</b>	14	20

## Irreps $\mathbf{r}_i$ of $\mathcal{T}_7$ and their indices

- $\mathbf{r}_i$  can originate from different irreps  $\rho$  of  $SU(3)$

$$\rho \longrightarrow \sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$$

- define discrete indices  $\tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ,  $\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$  such that:

$$A(\rho) = \sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i) \bmod N_A$$

$$\ell(\rho) = \sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i) \bmod N_\ell$$

for all irreps  $\rho$  of  $SU(3)$

## Discrete indices of $\mathcal{T}_7$

definition:

Irreps $\mathbf{r}_i$ of $\mathcal{T}_7$	$\tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ( $N_A = 7$ )	$\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ( $N_\ell = 3$ )
$\mathbf{1}'$	$x$	$y$
$\overline{\mathbf{1}'}$	$-x$	$1 - y$
$\mathbf{3}$	1	1
$\overline{\mathbf{3}}$	-1	1

consistency:

$\rho$	$\sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$	$A(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$	$\ell(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$
$\mathbf{3}$	$\mathbf{3}$	1	1	1	1
$\mathbf{6}$	$\mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}}$	7	0	5	2
$\mathbf{8}$	$\mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + \mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}}$	0	0	6	3
$\mathbf{10}$	$\mathbf{1} + \mathbf{3} + 2 \cdot \overline{\mathbf{3}}$	27	-1	15	3
$\mathbf{15}$	$\mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 2 \cdot (\mathbf{3} + \overline{\mathbf{3}})$	14	0	20	5

## Proving the assignment of discrete indices

- assign discrete indices to irreps  $\mathbf{r}_i$  using the decomposition of the smallest irreps  $\rho$  of  $SU(3)$
- proof by induction that this assignment is consistent for all higher irreps  $\rho$
- make use of:

$$I(\rho \otimes \sigma) = d(\rho) I(\sigma) + I(\rho) d(\sigma)$$

$I$  = Dynkin index  $A$  or  $\ell$

$d$  = dimension of irrep

## Discrete anomaly conditions

family symmetry  $SU(3)$       particles live in irreps  $\rho$  [normalization:  $Y(\rho) \in \mathbb{Z}$ ]



$$\sum_{\rho} A(\rho) = 0 \quad \sum_{\rho} \ell(\rho) \cdot Y(\rho) = 0$$

family symmetry  $T_7$       particles live in irreps  $r_i$

- some acquire masses (heavy)
- some don't (light)

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}_i + \sum_{i=\text{heavy}} \tilde{A}_i = 0 \bmod N_A$$

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}_i Y_i + \sum_{i=\text{heavy}} \tilde{\ell}_i Y_i = 0 \bmod N_\ell$$

## Effect of heavy fermions

- $\mathcal{T}_7$  invariant mass terms:  $\mathbf{1}' \otimes \overline{\mathbf{1}'} , \mathbf{3} \otimes \overline{\mathbf{3}}$
- with  $\mathcal{G} = \mathcal{T}_7$ : only Dirac particles can be massive
- contribution of heavy fermions to discrete anomalies:

$$\mathbf{3} \otimes \overline{\mathbf{3}} : \quad \sum_{i=1}^2 \tilde{A}_i = 0 \quad \sum_{i=1}^2 \tilde{\ell}_i \cdot Y_i = 0$$

$$\mathbf{1}' \otimes \overline{\mathbf{1}'} : \quad \sum_{i=1}^2 \tilde{A}_i = 0 \quad \sum_{i=1}^2 \tilde{\ell}_i \cdot Y_i = (2y - 1) \cdot Y(\mathbf{1}') \stackrel{!}{=} 0 \bmod 3$$

→ no contribution if  $y = \frac{1}{2}$  or 2 (and integer hypercharge normalization)

## $\mathcal{T}_7$ example: Luhn, Nasri, Ramond [PLB 652,27 (2007)]

- all hypercharges are integer
- hypercharge normalization  $Y_Q = 1$

}

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}_i &= 0 \bmod 7 \\ \sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}_i Y_i &= 0 \bmod 3 \end{aligned}$$

type of fermion	$Q$	$U^c$	$D^c$	$L$	$E^c$	$N^c$	
$\mathcal{T}_7$ irrep	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	$\tilde{A}(\mathbf{3}) = 1$
# of fermions	6	3	3	2	1	1	$\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{3}) = 1$
hypercharge $Y$	1	-4	2	-3	6	0	

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{A}_i = 6 + 3 + 3 + 2 + 1 + 1 = 16 \neq 0 \bmod 7$$

$$\sum_{i=\text{light}} \tilde{\ell}_i \cdot Y_i = 6 \cdot 1 + 3 \cdot (-4) + 3 \cdot 2 + 2 \cdot (-3) + 1 \cdot 6 + 1 \cdot 0 = 0$$

## Conclusion

- neutrino mixing motivates non-Abelian discrete family symmetry  $\mathcal{G}$
- many candidates for  $\mathcal{G}$  – many more models
- require gauge origin of  $\mathcal{G} \subset G_f = SU(3), SO(3), SU(2)$
- discuss remnants of the high-energy anomaly conditions
- introduce discrete indices (individually for each group  $\mathcal{G}$ )
- discrete anomaly conditions
- some models might be incomplete in their light particle content

## Different embeddings

- some groups  $\mathcal{G}$  are subgroups of different continuous groups  $G_f$
- e.g.  $\mathcal{A}_4 \subset SU(3)$  or  $\mathcal{A}_4 \subset SO(3)$
- Is it possible to define discrete indices independently from the embedding?

## Embedding $\mathcal{A}_4$ into $SU(3)$

discrete indices of  $\mathcal{A}_4$ :

Irreps $\mathbf{r}_i$ of $\mathcal{A}_4$	$\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ( $N_\ell = 12$ )	$\tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ( $N_A = 2$ )
<b>1</b>	0	0
<b>1'</b>	2	0
<b><math>\overline{1}'</math></b>	2	0
<b>3</b>	1	1

$\rho$	$\sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$	$\ell(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$	$A(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{A}(\mathbf{r}_i)$
<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	1	1	1	1
<b>6</b>	<b><math>1 + 1' + \overline{1}' + 3</math></b>	5	5	7	1
<b>8</b>	<b><math>1' + \overline{1}' + 2 \cdot 3</math></b>	6	6	0	2
<b>10</b>	<b><math>1 + 3 \cdot 3</math></b>	15	3	27	3
<b>15</b>	<b><math>1 + 1' + \overline{1}' + 4 \cdot 3</math></b>	20	8	14	4

## Embedding $\mathcal{A}_4$ into $SO(3)$

discrete indices of  $\mathcal{A}_4$ :

Irreps $\mathbf{r}_i$ of $\mathcal{A}_4$	$\tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$ ( $N_\ell = 12$ )	
$\mathbf{1}$	0	
$\mathbf{1}'$	2	
$\overline{\mathbf{1}'}$	2	
$\mathbf{3}$	1	

$\rho$	$\sum_i \mathbf{r}_i$	$\ell(\rho)$	$\sum_i \tilde{\ell}(\mathbf{r}_i)$		
$\mathbf{3}$	$\mathbf{3}$	1	1		
$\mathbf{5}$	$\mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + \mathbf{3}$	5	5		
$\mathbf{7}$	$\mathbf{1} + 2 \cdot \mathbf{3}$	14	2		
$\mathbf{9}$	$\mathbf{1} + \mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 2 \cdot \mathbf{3}$	30	6		
$\mathbf{11}$	$\mathbf{1}' + \overline{\mathbf{1}'} + 3 \cdot \mathbf{3}$	55	7		